

**AGENDA
CITY OF UNION CITY
SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL WORK SESSION**

**Thursday, February 25, 2010
7:00 P.M.**

**Ruggieri Senior Center Dining Hall
33997 Alvarado-Niles Road
Union City CA**

I. CALL TO ORDER

I.a Pledge of Allegiance

I.b Roll Call

Mayor Mark Green

Vice Mayor Richard Valle

Councilmember Carol Dutra-Vernaci

Councilmember Manny Fernandez

Councilmember Jim Navarro

II. PRESENTATION BY ALAMEDA COUNTY FIRE CHIEF SHELDON GILBERT

III. PUBLIC COMMENT

Comments from the audience regarding the topic under consideration will be received. Persons wishing to speak must complete a speaker card available from the City Clerk.

IV. CITY COUNCIL WORK SESSION REGARDING A PROPOSAL TO CONTRACT WITH ALAMEDA COUNTY FOR FIRE/PARAMEDIC SERVICES

V. ADJOURNMENT

A complete agenda packet is available for review at City Hall or our website www.unioncity.org

Any writings or documents provided to a majority of City Council members regarding any item on this agenda will be made available for public inspection at the City Clerk's Counter at City Hall, located at 34009 Alvarado-Niles Road, Union City, California, during normal business hours.

Assistance will be provided to those requiring accommodations for disabilities in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990. Interested person must request the accommodation at least two working days in advance of the meeting by contacting the City Clerk at (510) 675-5348.



Agenda Item

TO: Honorable City Council

FROM: Carlos Rodriguez, Fire Chief
Richard Digre, Administrative Services Director

DATE: February 25, 2010

SUBJECT: **Alameda County Proposal for Fire Service Contract**

On December 21, 2009, a Work Session of the City Council convened to explore and discuss the possibility of a Contract for Fire Services with the Alameda County Fire Department. At the conclusion of the Work Session, Council recommended the following:

- Staff to meet with bargaining groups in an attempt to diminish start-up and overall cost of a Contract for Fire Service Proposal.
- To schedule a Work Session for February 2010 to allow for public input and for Staff to report back on financial impacts.

BACKGROUND

In July 2008, Council authorized the City Manager to sign an agreement with Citygate Associates to conduct a joint feasibility study for consolidated fire services with the City of Union City and the City of Newark. The agreement also directed the consultant to evaluate and make recommendations regarding other regional fire service delivery options. The primary purpose of this study was to address critical emergency response deployment challenges previously identified in the June 2008 City of Union City Standards of Cover Analysis as adopted by Council in November 2008.

Citygate Associates concluded that a consolidation between the Union City and Newark Fire Departments would result in limited service enhancements and moderate cost reductions for Union City. Preliminary estimates received from the Alameda County Fire Department (ALCO) indicated an appealing savings of approximately \$1 million to Union City. Citygate recommended that Union City and Newark proceed with requesting a formal proposal from ALCO based on those projected savings.

In April 2009, staff was authorized by Council to request a formal amplified study from ALCO for contract fire protection equivalent to the current service delivery model employed by Union City. Significant staff time was dedicated to data collection and information exchange with the Alameda County and Newark Fire Departments. Staff provided input into the proposed service levels and carefully analyzed city-wide fiscal impacts during the process. A draft proposal was submitted by ALCO in September 2009 and updated in November 2009.

While exploring fire protection options with Alameda County, the City of Union City was in the midst of preparing an unprecedented 2-year budget with a mandated 20% cut from all City Departments. With the bulk of the Fire Department budget earmarked for personnel cost, the Fire Chief had no choice but to cut positions with the clear intent and vision to preserve emergency response and avoidance of Fire Station closures or "brown-outs". With the layoff of management staff, a hazardous materials inspector, freezing current vacancies and reaching a cooperative agreement with IAFF Local 1946 and Fire Managers to receive compensatory time in lieu of overtime pay, the fire department was successful in meeting these significant cuts without affecting emergency response with the Fire Chief and Assistant Chief absorbing additional duties. With the adoption of the current savings in the current 2 year budget, the anticipated lucrative preliminary savings expressed by Alameda County contract dissolved.

DISCUSSION

To accurately and fairly compare financial and staffing levels, the City of Union City Finance and Fire Departments worked collaboratively with Alameda County to perform an "apples to apples" financial and staffing comparison utilizing the current budget as well as previous year budget to reflect the true cost prior to the current budget cuts. The Alco proposal calls for the absorption of our public safety personnel and continue to provide Emergency response with the current compliment of 4 Engine Companies, with the City continuing to provide building and ground maintenance of the Fire Stations and maintenance and replacement of all fire apparatus. Alameda County is also committed to obtain inclusion from a City Managers Forum from contract agencies with final and ultimate voting and decision-making resting on the Alameda County Board of Supervisors.

The Alco proposal includes a core employee absorption and additional service options components. The core employee absorption consists of four (4) staffed Engine Companies with one (1) Firefighter, one (1) Fire Engineer and one (1) Fire Captain. The proposal also calls for a Battalion Chief that will manage firefighting resources for the City of Newark and the City of Union City and the absorption of the Assistant Chief. Additional service options include the absorption of the Union City Fire Chief as a Deputy Chief, Deputy Fire Marshal, Fire Code Compliance Inspector, Fire Inspector, Fire Plan Checker, Public Education and an Emergency Preparedness Manager. All of these items are available at an additional cost.

Recommendations:

Staff recommends that the City Council conduct a work session and give general direction as to whether or not staff should continue pursuing a contract for fire services with the Alameda County Fire Department. Should the Council give direction to pursue a contract, the City and ACFD will negotiate the terms of such an agreement and bring it back to Council at a meeting in April, with the intent to have start date of July 1, 2010.

UNION CITY TO ACFD COST COMPARISON (Summary)
 (Note: Negative Diff. Means ACFD less expensive than UC)

25-Feb-10

Account Description	UNION CITY	ACFD Cost	
	Bud/Actual	Proposal	
Base Salary & Specialty Pays	5,156,209	4,889,294	
Health & Dental Insurance	713,712	633,123	
Retire Medical - ARC	39,000	369,000	
Retiree Medical - Pr. Service Cost	31,000	129,000	
Retirement Cost	1,678,604	1,114,602	
Workers Comp	581,792	146,986	
Other Benefits & Pay	311,664	412,838	
Overtime	803,457	1,033,259	
OPTION: Administrative Assistant (UC Cosst)	68,012	68,012	
OPTION: Plan Checker	-	21,195	
OPTION: Assistant Chief	-	26,660	
OPTION: Emergency Preparedness	-	19,447	
OPTION: Fire Code Compliance Ofc.	-	60,558	
OPTION: Asst. Fire Marshal Half Time	-	104,387	
Salary & Benefits	9,383,450	9,028,361	(355,089)
Supplies and Services	589,563	768,987	179,424
Capital Outlay	23,502	81,097	57,595
Gross Operating Cost Saving to Union City	9,996,515	9,878,445	(118,070)
Increased PERS for Sworn Police Officers		150,000	
5-Year Amorization of ACFD Start up Costs		23,669	
Net Operating Cost to Union City	9,996,515	10,052,114	55,599

Optional Cost Item - Deputy Fire Chief \$ 262,276
 One Time Leave Balance Payout Costs \$ 603,262

ADDITIONAL COSTS -DETAIL	Unit Cost	Cost	
Start up Costs			
ACFD Costs (Estimated)			
Veh. & Eq: Apparatus ACFD Decal Package	1,500	\$ 19,500	
IT: Rtr, Swch & T-1 Install, Locution Computers, Pi	11,000	44,000	
Personnel: Captain Orientation	67	19,296	
Personnel: Engineer Orientation	60	28,800	
Personnel: Badges and Name Plates	150	6,750	
ACFD Costs (Estimated) Amortized over 5 years		\$ 118,346	\$ 23,669
Leave Balance Payout		Dec. 22, 09	02/12/10
Accrued Vacation Payout (\$318,884 \$427,486Trf to ACFD)		\$ 131,873	102,841
Holiday Leave		19,361	11,363
Floating Holiday		2,925	1,696
Admin. Leave		28,881	26,409
Accrued Sick Leave -\$1,074,397 \$952,847		-	
Accrued Comp Time Payout		274,630	460,953
Leave Balance Pay out Cost as of ...		\$ 457,670	\$ 603,262

UNION CITY TO ACFD STAFFING COMPARISON

	Staffing (FTE's)		Variance
	Union City	ACFD Prop:	
Fire Fighter	17	12	Constant Staffing, 5 absorbed by ACFD
Engineer	12	12	
Captain	12	12	
Batallion Chief	3	1.5	Shared Cost with Newark
EMS Coordinator	1	0.24	Allocated Cost
Deputy Fire Marshal	0	0.5	Shared Cost
Asstant Fire Chief	1	0.12	Allocated Cost
Fire Chief	1	0.12	Allocated Cost
Plan Checker	0.5	0.5	
Fire Code Compliance Officer	0.5	0.5	
Admin Assistant	0.5	0.5	
Deputy Chief		0.34	
Division Chief		0.12	
Fire Marshal		0.14	
EMS Director		0.12	
Captain - Staff		0.61	
TOTAL FTE's	48.5	41.30	